

MINUTES
Legislative Education Study Committee
Santa Fe Community College, Jemez Room
and
State Capitol, Room 322
Santa Fe, New Mexico
October 22 – 24, 2018

October 22, 2018

The following voting and advisory members were present: Voting: Chair Mimi Stewart, Vice Chair G. Andres Romero, Senators Craig W. Brandt and William P. Soules, and Representatives Alonzo Baldonado, Dennis J. Roch, Christine Trujillo, and Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton; Advisory: Senators Linda M. Lopez and Howie C. Morales, and Representatives Kelly K. Fajardo, Joanne J. Ferrary, Stephanie Garcia Richard, Patricia Roybal Caballero, Tomas E. Salazar, Elizabeth "Liz" Thomson, and Linda M. Trujillo.

The following voting and advisory members were not present: Voting: Senator Candace Gould and Representative Monica Youngblood; Advisory: Senators Carlos Cisneros, Daniel A. Ivey-Soto, Gay G. Kernan, Michael Padilla, and John Pinto, and Representatives David M. Gallegos, Jimmie C. Hall, D. Wonda Johnson, Tim D. Lewis, Rick Little, Angelica Rubio, Patricio Ruiloba, Gregg Schmedes, Debra M. Sarinana, and Jim R. Trujillo.

Welcoming Remarks and Strategic Initiatives of Santa Fe Community College. Dr. Cecilia Cervantes, Interim President of Santa Fe Community College (SFCC), reviewed SFCC's background and history, noting it was established in 1983 and serves 13 thousand students annually. The college is a small business development center, and features the Early Childhood Center of Excellence. Fifty percent of the undergraduate population comprises students of color, and 58 percent of full-time beginning students come from low-income backgrounds.

Dr. Cervantes reviewed SFCC's community numerous partnerships, including their work with the United Way and Santa Fe Public Schools as a member of Opportunity Santa Fe Birth to Career. She noted Bellevue College was also poised to partner with SFCC.

SFCC focuses on training for middle skill jobs, which make up a large part of the state's labor market. Areas of focus include healthcare and trades, such as welding, plumbing, and auto mechanics. SFCC has increased degree and certificate completion by 95 percent since 2011. Dr. Cervantes noted the greatest barrier to higher education is poverty, with some possible solutions for consideration including: increasing the number of counselors in high schools; redesigning dual credit courses to ensure they lead to a certificate; and simplifying the college application process and requiring only one application for all New Mexico colleges.

Prompted by a question from Vice Chair Romero, Yash Morimoto, Associate Vice President of SFCC, noted SFCC is part of the Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education program, permitting easy transfer of credits between institutions in the program via the Interstate Passport Agreement, and many students even participate in the Western Undergraduate Exchange (WUE) program.

Senator Soules asked what SFCC is doing to address the needs of Native American students. Dr. Cervantes replied SFCC is partnering with the pueblos in an attempt to craft an all-pueblo partnership, but noted challenges in transportation and internet availability. One pueblo recently discussed having a certified nursing assistant program on-site due to their needs of having allied health, phlebotomists, and medical assistants.

Representative Ferrari asked about how dual credit programs impact SFCC's budget. Dr. Cervantes noted SFCC does not charge tuition for dual credit courses, leaving SFCC to absorb those costs.

Representative Roybal-Caballero asked if SFCC contacted any of the trade unions about potential partnerships. Dr. Cervantes said SFCC is working with the trade unions for apprenticeships, offering a hands-on pathway for students. Welding and plumbing have apprenticeship possibilities. The fields that lack available trade apprenticeships may be appropriate for paid internships.

Representative Salazar asked about SFCC's service area. Mr. Morimoto said statute defines SFCC's service area as Santa Fe County, from which 85 percent of their students originate, but noted SFCC also provides online services across the state. Dr. Cervantes noted that while online programs are offered, students seem to do better with some in-person time with instructors. The representative then asked about the small business development center and what entities partner with the center. Dr. Cervantes said state and federal funding permitted the establishment of a small business center network that is primarily housed in 18 financial institutions around the state, which any business can utilize.

Representative Linda Trujillo indicated she and other schoolboard members discussed asking SFCC to pursue a new program to start training first responders such as police, firefighters, and emergency medical technicians.

Implementation of New Mexico STEM-Ready Science Standards. Dr. Debra N. Thrall, Executive Board Member of the New Mexico Science Teachers Association (NMSTA) and Co-Coordinator of the Jumpstart Saturday Project said the New Mexico STEM-Ready Science Standards (NMSRSS) combine the Next Generation Science Standards (NGSS) with six New Mexico-specific standards. Dr. Thrall said the new standards affect instructional materials, course descriptions, professional development, and assessments, but noted the Public Education Department (PED) is not providing sufficient professional development to schools statewide. She said the standards address core ideas, practices, and cross cutting concepts, but noted new, middle-career, and older teachers do not have the training to effectively implement the new standards. She noted PED recently hosted a STEM symposium and NMSTA has been holding workshops across New Mexico to supplement this training for over 200 teachers. Many teachers, especially elementary school teachers, that do not specialize in science are concerned because school grades now include science assessment scores. Teachers want to learn how to teach the standards and administrators want to know what standards-based instruction looks like. NMSTA recommends a two-day, hands-on workshop for teachers and administrators.

Gwendolyn Perea Warniment, K-12 Program Director at the Los Alamos National Laboratory (LANL) Foundation, said since 2015, the Inquiry Science Education Consortium has supported NMSRSS-aligned instruction for over 11 thousand students, 600 teachers, eight school districts, and three Bureau of Indian Education schools. She said the program has built a community of practice through a teacher cadre that focuses on building STEM education, assessment, and social-emotional learning capacity. She said there are several barriers to successful implementation of NMSRSS, including teacher turnover, a short implementation timeline, and the lack of time teachers have to devote to the initiative. She said statewide implementation is lacking a coordinated effort and that PED must honor local control while recognizing rural districts need more support.

Stan Rounds, Executive Director of the New Mexico Coalition of Educational Leaders, reiterated the importance of a cohesive NMSRSS plan for implementation. He said \$30 million would be ideal for proper implementation with an additional \$5 million recurring appropriation that would cover instructional materials that are not textbooks.

Chair Stewart asked the presenters if they were including hands-on materials and science kits when they referred to instructional materials. Dr. Thrall said yes, but stated the quoted dollar amount she mentioned was only to cover instructional materials for non-special education students. Materials must be purchased for all students, so costs likely will be more than the \$28 million she estimated, including an additional \$5 million for professional development. Ms. Perea Warniment stated consumable materials are a recurring cost.

Representative Christine Trujillo shared her concern that the Legislature appropriated money for implementation of the new standards, but PED has used very little of it to date. Mr. Rounds responded that PED's distribution of funds to school districts has been very limited. Rachel S. Gudgel, Director of LESC, said \$3.5 million was appropriated to PED for use in FY19 to ensure implementation of the new standards, but staff review showed only \$750 thousand of the total amount has been spent and about half of that was used for PED's teacher supply debit card initiative. It is unclear how PED plans to use the funds to support school districts in NMSRSS implementation.

Representative Roch stated Discovery Education has launched NGSS academies around the state to train teachers on the new science standards. He asked about what would be the best professional development model and whether PED or corporate entities should run them. Dr. Thrall stated Discovery Education charges about \$75 per teacher. NMSTA does not charge for teachers to attend trainings. She recommended a group of New Mexico science educators should train school districts and not corporate funded entities. Representative Roch asked how stakeholders can ensure that the selected instructional materials are aligned to the new standards. Ms. Perea Warniment suggested critiquing the materials by observing their implementation.

In response to Senator Soules, Dr. Thrall said some teachers across the state were resistant to the change in instructional practice, but better understood the new practice and were more receptive after receiving training.

Senator Soules stated the Legislature plays a role in providing appropriate funds for materials and professional development, but PED must handle the professional development. He asked if there are other areas where the Legislature can make a difference. Mr. Rounds estimated \$43 million for materials would help successfully implement NMSRSS.

Tour of Santa Fe Community College. SFCC staff provided a tour of SFCC, which included several facilities where students work in labs that simulate medical situations. High-quality animatronic mannequins are used to simulate any medical occurrence, though they are used primarily to expose medical students and residents to high-risk, low-occurrence events which will leave them better equipped to deal with emergencies in the field.

2018 Statewide Town Hall: Strengthening Higher Education and Tomorrow's Workforce. Pamela Blackwell, Senior Policy Director of New Mexico First, said over 200 people attended a New Mexico First-sponsored town hall over a two-day period to discuss higher education and strengthening the state's workforce. Three themes emerged from the town hall, including improving the transition from high school to college and career, better alignment of higher education offerings with the state's workforce, and improving collaboration between colleges and universities to better utilize the workforce. Ms. Blackwell noted they were not appearing before the committee to ask for anything, but to encourage a focus on student-centered solutions to the issues facing the state's workforce.

Randy Grissom, a former president of Santa Fe Community College, discussed postsecondary students, noting 40 percent of New Mexico college students require remediation, and 28 percent of freshman do not make it to their sophomore year. He recommended reinstating the college affordability fund; revenue was swept from the fund during the economic downturn. In the past,

the fund was used to make awards up to \$1,000 to students who did not qualify for the legislative lottery scholarship or other state programs.

Ms. Blackwell spoke about the Sun Path program, a results-driven education and work force program in the state. Sun Path is a partnership between higher education institutions and over 200 employers, funded through a \$15 million U.S. Department of Labor start-up grant that ended in September 2018. Students completed certificate or degree work 34 percent more frequently than non-participants and were hired at a rate 14 percent higher than non-participants with greater earning potential than non-participants. The program is data-supported and in the top 10 for education and workforce alignment. She indicated New Mexico First plans to present legislation to sustain the program during the legislative session.

Grant Taylor, Economic Policy Director for New Mexico First, spoke about the need for workers in the state's energy industry, noting needed jobs skills are more technical, requiring greater science, technology, engineering, and mathematics proficiency. Even a seven-day course for no academic credit can yield a substantial salary increase. He noted a 10-year roadmap was completed this year that includes 15 goals and 60 strategies to achieve a diverse and efficient energy profile with a better educated workforce.

Del Archuleta, President and Owner of Molzen Corbin, talked about the governance of higher education, noting New Mexico has a complex system of 29 public colleges, universities, and tribal campuses with 77 points of access, including satellite locations, seven boards of regents, 10 branch campuses, advisory boards, and seven community college boards. He indicated accountability was important, as was the appointment of regents, but training for these boards is more important.

Chair Stewart had never heard of Sun Path and asked for more information. Kristen Krall of Sun Path indicated the goal of the project was to expand capacity and create systemic improvement in the delivery of healthcare through career pathways aligned with industry needs. The project focuses on increasing the attainment of degrees and industry certificates and aligning the education with workforce needs to create better employee retention and improved earnings in the state's workforce. Ms. Blackwell noted they bring employers into the classroom and identify needs within the state to ensure higher education is offering aligned programs.

Chair Stewart asked how Sun Path is helping move the state workforce toward a diversified energy profile. Ms. Blackwell noted the model can be adapted for other needs including energy and information technology; the initial focus was on healthcare because the field includes approximately two-thirds of the jobs in the state.

Representative Roybal Caballero asked how the \$15 million U.S. Department of Labor grant was leveraged. Ms. Blackwell noted the money was given to 11 community colleges and the workforce system and used over four years, including a \$1.5 million contract with the Department of Workforce Solutions. They trained employees to enroll students in the workforce system, helping place them in jobs. They leveraged adult education funds to provide basic skills instructors to build math and literacy skills. Mr. Grisham noted the \$15 million was a consortium grant for startup, and they are asking for \$3 million dollars per year to keep this alignment and expand into energy and the public education system.

Vice Chair Romero indicated the college affordability endowment fund is in its last year, but as one of the only need-based scholarships, he would like to see it reinstated. He asked if the Higher Education Department (HED) tracks where the scholarships are going, what the students are studying, and their postsecondary outcomes. Dr. Harry Rommel, Director of Financial Aid and Institutional Finance at HED, replied they have not done any detailed analysis on what students are studying, and that analysis would require collaboration with the community colleges. He offered to research the issue and get back to the Vice Chair during the legislative session.

Santa Fe Community College – Early Childhood Educator Programs – I-BEST and Early Childhood Certificates. Dr. Jennifer Duran-Sallee, Director of the Early Childhood Center of Excellence at Santa Fe Community College (SFCC) and Olga Jaramillo, Adjunct Faculty at SFCC, outlined SFCC’s early childhood educator preparation programs. Dr. Duran-Sallee said SFCC has an alternative licensure program for students with a bachelor’s degree to earn a certificate to teach in early childhood education. SFCC also has an associate’s degree program in early childhood, infant-family studies, the I-BEST program, and the bilingual early childhood program.

Dr. Duran-Sallee said I-BEST stands for Integrated Basic Educational Skills and Training. SFCC has this program because of Sun Path. The I-BEST program can be completed in as little as one year and early childhood workforce shortages mean students graduate to a competitive job market. The goal is to support the student through graduation to the workforce. I-BEST uses a blended cohort model with two instructors – a lead instructor with content knowledge and another instructor with the ability to teach basic skills. Dr. Duran-Sallee explained when an I-BEST student does not have a high school diploma, the student will work on GED and remedial coursework at the same time. Of all participants, 88 percent have graduated and 75 percent of early childhood graduates are now employed.

Dr. Duran-Sallee provided history of SFCC’s I-BEST bilingual program. Two years ago, SFCC provided an early childhood education workshop and was asked to provide the same workshop in Spanish, which they did two weeks later; it filled to capacity. At this workshop, SFCC talked about the employment opportunities available for individuals that wanted to go back to school. Dr. Duran-Sallee was asked to offer the entry-level courses in Spanish. Ms. Jaramillo was recruited and spearheaded the bilingual early childhood program. SFCC partnered with Central New Mexico Community College (CNM), which already had a bilingual program.

Ms. Jaramillo said the program started in June 2016 and offers the child development certificate (CDC). Students are diverse, but most are parents who dreamed of going to college. This past summer, 13 students received their CDC’s and either opened their own family daycares, work as teacher assistants for infants and toddlers, or became prekindergarten teacher assistants with United Way and Santa Fe Public Schools. This summer, 13 more students will receive their CDC’s.

Chair Stewart asked what Dr. Duran-Sallee meant when she said this program is part of Sun Path. Dr. Duran-Sallee said Sun Path funded the second teacher in the classroom, which is a model for the I-BEST program. Chair Stewart then asked how many early childhood educators are produced each year. Dr. Duran-Sallee said it depends on the program, but CDC students can only teach for the Children, Youth and Families Department (CYFD), or as an assistant teacher for PED.

Representative Ferrary asked if master teachers are working in some of the centers. Dr. Duran-Sallee replied yes and noted SFCC’s mentorship network is expanding.

Representative Roybal Caballero asked whether CYFD or PED prekindergarten programs were more effective. Dr. Duran-Sallee replied she has seen reports by the National Institute of Early Education Research indicating the programs work equally well. Representative Roybal Caballero asked how many other community colleges in New Mexico offer this same type of program. Dr. Duran-Sallee replied only CNM and SFCC offer bilingual early childhood educator preparation programs.

National Dance Institute New Mexico: Dancing to Academic Success. Patrick Velasquez, a student at Carlos Vigil Middle School, stated he has been a National Dance Institute (NDI) student

since fourth grade. He stated it had helped him mentally, physically, and academically. NDI helped him keep fit and gave him confidence.

Coleen Korse, the principal of Chaparral Elementary School in Santa Fe Public Schools, said NDI's ideology matched the mindset she would like students to have in academics. She also said student proficiency on the PARCC assessment improved for students participating in NDI.

Russel Baker, Executive Director of NDI, stated NDI is celebrating its 25th anniversary as a statewide nonprofit organization. Children who participate in NDI say they feel more energized and equipped and ready to take on the challenges of school. Teachers say NDI students are ready to work on problems as a team, and parents note their students are more health conscious. Mr. Baker said students in the NDI program are outperforming their peers in all four areas of standardized testing. The GPAs of NDI students are also a full grade point higher.

Chair Stewart asked Mr. Baker how NDI is funded. Mr. Baker said funding comes from a variety of public and private sources but they would like to have more support from government agencies, including the state. He said about 100 schools are on the NDI waitlist for services and NDI wants to expand the program. Mr. Baker expressed NDI would need additional qualified and trained dance teachers to meet demands, in addition to more funding. Mr. Baker said NDI has a residency program for dance teachers, and the program likes to recruit former NDI participants to teach NDI, though they bring some teachers in from out of state. NDI has about 45 full-time staff but much of the staff are part-time workers.

Charlotte Martinez, NDI alumni, shared her experience related to how NDI affected her academically. She was involved with NDI for nine years during her adolescence. She recalled NDI made her a better student and a more avid reader.

October 23, 2018

The following voting and advisory members were present: Voting: Chair Mimi Stewart, Vice Chair G. Andres Romero, Senators Craig W. Brandt and William P. Soules, and Representatives Alonzo Baldonado, Dennis J. Roch, Christine Trujillo, and Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton; Advisory: Senators Linda M. Lopez and Michael Padilla, and Representatives Kelly K. Fajardo, Stephanie Garcia Richard, Rick Little, Patricia Roybal Caballero, Patricio Ruiloba, Tomas E. Salazar, and Linda M. Trujillo.

The following voting and advisory members were not present: Voting: Senator Candace Gould and Representative Monica Youngblood; Advisory: Senators Carlos Cisneros, Daniel A. Ivey-Soto, Gay G. Kernan, Howie C. Morales, and John Pinto, and Representatives Joanne J. Ferarry, David M. Gallegos, Jimmie C. Hall, D. Wonda Johnson, Tim D. Lewis, Angelica Rubio, Gregg Schmedes, Debra M. Sarinana, Elizabeth "Liz" Thomson, and Jim R. Trujillo.

Trauma Informed Instruction: The Science of Learning and Conditions for Teaching and Learning. Dr. David Osher, Vice President and Institute Fellow at American Institutes for Research (AIR), discussed the conditions for learning equity. Dr. Osher and his team looked across many disciplines and sciences to find a convergence around the science of learning. Social-emotional competencies work in combination with academic learning to enhance academic performance. When there are strong conditions for learning, students are able to learn and perform academically. These conditions are physical and emotional safety; a feeling of belonging; being challenged; and existing in an environment where teachers and students are socially and emotionally competent. Having social-emotional skills does not increase reading or math scores, but combining the skills with high quality instruction can enhance performance in these areas.

The science of learning says social-emotional competencies, such as resilience, can be developed. Neurobiological studies looking at brain networks shows the networks relating to cognitive and social-emotional work are interconnected. To maximize the learning potential of young people, the interconnectivity of their cognitive and social-emotional development must be addressed. How students grow and develop is not only due to the brain's malleability and plasticity, but also to the brain's ability to make sense of and moderate events.

When fear is experienced, the body releases cortisol to cause a fight, freeze, or flight response. Some stress is good, but when it is excessive, it affects performance, behavior, and health.

Research shows any adverse childhood experience (ACE) by itself is powerful, but the combination of ACEs is even more powerful. Historical trauma is about the relived experiences of traumatizing events. For example, if a family has been punished for speaking Spanish, and teachers punish students who speak Spanish, the student's experience is consistent with the family narrative. Physical symptoms like headaches, stomach aches, and angry or aggressive outbursts can be responses to ACEs. If teachers do not understand this, they may blame the student as malevolent, rather than dealing with a mental health issue.

Dr. Osher said he believes school climate should be measured by how motivated and excited students are about learning. Students should feel they can be competent individuals with the capacity to learn. In a study, teachers were told some of the students in their class had tested as "gifted," but were not told which students they were. This led to increased achievement for all students. Students should be viewed as "at-promise," rather than "at-risk". Dr. Osher recommended his book, *Creating Safe, Equitable, Engaging Schools: A Comprehensive, Evidence-Based Approach to Supporting Students*.

Chair Stewart asked for a description of school-wide behavioral health teams in Finland. Dr. Osher described the Finnish model, which consists of a school psychologist, a behavioral specialist, and an assistant principal. The team counsels students and provides consulting for school staff. The group is effective because when individuals are knowledgeable about both education and mental health, they learn who is falling through the cracks and can address those needs.

Senator Padilla asked how cortisol is measured. Dr. Osher responded cortisol can be measured in hair follicles and saliva, and mentioned researchers at AIR are developing a tool that uses artificial intelligence and facial expressions to measure students' engagement.

Representative Ruiloba asked how to get trauma-informed instruction into schools. Dr. Osher stated readiness assessments can help determine how to implement trauma-informed instruction in schools. There are culturally-responsive restorative practices being done in the Austin School District in Texas. New York City is implementing a restorative practice intervention and equipping teachers with tools to respond differently to children. In both cases, the readiness assessments helped determine whether schools were ready for implementation of trauma-informed instruction.

In response to Representative Salazar's question, Dr. Osher replied a number of states are implementing trauma-informed practices. AIR provides technical support to a program funded by the National Institute of Justice that is working with Washington, Connecticut, and Illinois. There is also a National Trauma Stress Network connected to various universities across the country.

Representative Salazar spoke about children who are afraid of being deported. He stated it is not unusual for students to come to class crying, indicating they were unable to sleep, concerned about what is going to happen in their life. Dr. Osher responded that students who experience these situations can be very vulnerable and will benefit from support. Parents or other family

members may also require support. If parents feel vulnerable, it makes it more difficult for them to act as a buffer for their child's stress. Children who are worried about deportation are not going to learn unless the issue is emotionally addressed. One effective practice is to start the day with class meetings. Class meetings can help students talk about their emotional baggage and become more empathetic toward each other.

Legislative Finance Committee Program Evaluation: Instructional Time and Extended Learning Opportunities in Public Schools. Alison Nichols, Program Evaluator for the Legislative Finance Committee (LFC), presented LFC's program evaluation: Instructional Time and Extended Learning Opportunities in Public Schools. She started by explaining extended learning time can help close achievement gaps. High quality extended learning time could be a valuable tool, especially for at-risk students. Low-income and minority students may disproportionately face a lack of resources over the summer and high-quality learning time could be an equalizer. In New Mexico, programs like K-3 Plus provide additional learning days and have shown promise in closing achievement gaps.

In New Mexico, the minimum instructional hours students must receive are between 990 and 1,080 hours. Local education agencies (LEAs) may offer a four-day schedule. In general, U.S. students overall have fewer school days than students in high-performing academic systems elsewhere in the world, though the United States requires an amount of instructional hours similar to other countries. Clayton Lobaugh, Program Evaluator at LFC, said implementation of teacher professional development varies widely. Early release days can add significant time for important teacher activities but early release days are not consistently tracked or reported to the Public Education Department (PED).

K-3 Plus significantly boosts learning time for participants and has shown positive effects on student achievement. The program is most effective if specific conditions are met. The number of New Mexico LEA's with a four-day school week schedule has increased by over one third since the 2010-2011 school year. Actual savings for schools with four-day weeks vary.

Ms. Nichols said LFC recommends amending state law to require professional development programs to be evidence-based; investing in a phased-in K-3 Plus and K-5 Plus expansion, which includes oversight and data collection mechanisms, to cover more students at eligible schools; and adding an extended learning time program component to the funding formula. LFC staff also recommended prohibiting the adoption of four-day schedules for school districts or charter schools that do not meet academic standards and requiring LEA's using a four-day week schedule to revert to a five-day week schedule if they do not meet academic standards. PED should require LEA's to report use of early release days.

Chair Stewart said comparing compulsory school days between high performing countries and the United States is difficult because a school day in a high-performing country is very different than a school day in the United States. Chair Stewart said she does not understand LFC's recommendation for K-3 Plus to start two weeks or less before school starts. Nathan Eckberg, Program Evaluator at LFC, said there is an average of 15 days between the end of K-3 Plus and the beginning of the school year, and reducing that gap would improve students' retention of information.

Representative Roch said added time must be high-quality and taught by effective teachers; the number one indicator of student success and achievement is the effectiveness of the teacher in the classroom. Representative Roch asked why the summer disproportionately affects at-risk students. Ms. Nichols said research suggests during the summer, middle-income and high-income students are disproportionately more likely to have access to learning opportunities such as

summer camps or family travel, than their low-income peers. Representative Roch also asked if there was an additional recommendation about the quality of professional development days beyond just the number of days. Ms. Nichols said quality time is more important than the amount of time, but the evaluation was meant to consider time as an important tool, not an answer by itself. Representative Roch said he believes LFC did not look at this issue comprehensively enough. Representative Roch also noted finances might be one reason to move to a four-day week, but it is often one of many. He noted LFC should balance quantitative measures with qualitative research. Representative Roch said he was hesitant to add K-3 Plus to the funding formula because PED is not currently fulfilling their oversight responsibilities.

Senator Brandt asked about the measurements in time for the report because the research presented by LESC staff was inconsistent with LFC's findings. Chair Stewart noted the study was about a specific population of students so it is different than making assumptions for all students. Senator Brandt stated LESC's report on school time noted the evidence regarding outcomes for four-day week schedules was inconclusive, and outcomes are the most important thing.

Representative Garcia Richard said LFC delivered a report on prekindergarten and K-3 Plus, which found student scores were better than students who had not had the combination of those two things. Senator Brandt said the only thing that has shown a positive result for the K-3 Plus program is having the same teacher throughout the program. The recommendations from this report are asking to increase investments in the program without any data showing it actually works. Mr. Lobaugh noted the importance of program fidelity is highlighted and emphasized it would be a requirement of getting programs approved. Senator Brandt noted the state needs to make sure there is enough time for collaboration and that the time is being used that way.

Senator Soules wondered if funding for K-3 Plus could be more consistent. Charles Sallee, Deputy Director of LFC, discussed some options for changing the way K-3 Plus is funded and implications of doing so. The committee briefly discussed implications for PED not following the law when it comes to how programs are operated. Senator Soules said the quality of instruction is better when teachers have the ability to plan. He said one of the key things is extending instructional time but also extending time for teachers to plan. Chair Stewart highlighted the importance of home visiting and parent-teacher conference time. It is important that teachers care enough to meet parents and discuss expectations for their children.

Potential Committee-Endorsed Legislation. Rachel S. Gudel, LESC Director, and Kevin Force, LESC staff, reviewed ideas for legislation that the committee might consider endorsing, arising from the committee's 2018 interim work, including matters of concern to members, educators, and other stakeholders, as follows:

- A bill to increase the at-risk index to 0.15, noting projected revenues may allow full implementation of changes enacted in Laws 2018, Chapter 55 (House Bill 188) in FY20. Representative Roch asked staff to look into also fully implementing the teacher cost index. Chair Stewart noted she would like to see the at-risk index increased even more than the 0.15.
- A bill that would move K-3 Plus into the public school funding formula. There was some discussion by the committee related to extending the bill's provisions to include K-5 Plus, as well as whether program approval would be required to receive funding, as is done with several formula programs.
- A bill to require public schools to change their yearly calendars so breaks comprise no more than 22 days and have at least 21 teaching days between breaks. The bill would also phase in an extension in teacher calendars, and teacher contracts would have 188 days in FY20, 194 days in FY21, and 200 days in FY22. Concern was noted over teacher professional development, and the impact on student extracurricular activities and summer jobs.

- A bill to replace the three-tiered licensure system with a six-step licensure system that would increase pay at each level, reflective of experience, professional development, and teacher evaluations. Step one teachers would be paid a minimum of \$40 thousand with no additional responsibilities, while a step six teacher would be paid a minimum of \$65 thousand, with half of their time spent mentoring other teachers. Responsibilities would shift from only classroom instruction to mentoring as they advance through the system.
- A bill that would increase teacher minimum salaries to \$40 thousand, \$50 thousand, and \$60 thousand for level one, level two, and level three-A teachers and counselors in FY20, and by an additional \$2,500 each year during FY21 and FY22. The bill would also set minimum salaries for principals and assistant principals at the minimum for level three-A teachers multiplied by the appropriate responsibility factor. Representative Linda Trujillo suggested raising the minimum salaries of noncertified personnel to \$15 per hour.
- A bill to set an age limit for students funded through the public school funding formula at 22 years old, the same age to which special education students are limited. Mr. Force indicated in FY18, 772 students over the age of 22 were funded through the funding formula for \$6.3 million dollars.
- A bill that would adjust a charter school's funding formula allocation if it experienced an enrollment reduction of more than 15 percent from the previous year; the school's funding formula allocation would be determined by current year, rather than prior year, enrollment. Ms. Gudgel highlighted New Mexico Connections Academy, which lost more than 50 percent of its students after a determination by the Public Education Commission, upheld by PED, that the school's charter be ended for poor academic performance.
- A bill that addressed school security concerns by providing a grant to schools for security personnel, allows retired law enforcement officers to maintain their pension's cost of living adjustment if they were employed by a school as security personnel, establishes a fourth degree felony for threatening a school shooting; reducing the total number of fire drills and requiring shelter-in-place drills, and prohibiting offsets for security projects. Discussion included suggesting that the bill be broken into several parts.
- A bill that would establish a public education planning commission, tasked with making recommendations to the Legislature and the governor to improve college- and career-readiness, update the funding formula, and make policy recommendations to help the state public education to perform more on par with top-performing states and countries. The commission would comprise legislative and executive representation, education stakeholders, and business representatives. Representative Roybal-Caballero recommended the Public Education Commission should conduct the work.
- A bill that would allow teachers to apply for a level two license after completing a minimum of three years of teaching under either a traditional or alternative level one license.
- A bill to define "school security personnel," who are able to carry deadly weapons on school premises as individuals employed by a local school district or charter school to act as armed security only, with no other job titles or related duties, including school resource officers, licensed private security company personnel, and contractors licensed as level three security guards. Senator Brandt was concerned about the limitation of duties, noting small and rural school district employees often act in more than one capacity, while Representative Linda Trujillo replied one of the purposes of the bill was to so limit duties.
- A bill that would update a repealed school improvement framework to comply with the federal Every Student Succeeds Act.
- A bill that would remove a reference to ninth grade standards-based assessments in the A-B-C-D-F Schools Rating Act because the Assessment and Accountability Act does not require standards-based assessments in ninth grade. Representative Roch stated removing a year of assessments may hamper PED's ability to calculate growth.

- Two appropriation bills – one for \$100 thousand to PED to train teachers in “brain education” and one for \$2 million to PED for afterschool and summer enrichment programs.

Senator Soules moved the committee authorize LESC staff to use the \$100 thousand dollars appropriated during the 2018 legislative session for an education gap analysis in consultation with the Learning Policy Institute and National Center on Education and the Economy. Representative Christine Trujillo seconded the motion, which passed 4:3, with Representatives Roch and Stapleton and Senator Brandt voting in the negative. Chair Stewart, Senator Soules, Representative Christine Trujillo, and Vice Chair Romero voted in favor of the motion.

October 24, 2018

The following voting and advisory members were present: Voting: Chair Mimi Stewart, Senators Craig W. Brandt and William P. Soules, and Representatives Alonzo Baldonado, Dennis J. Roch, and Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton; Advisory: Senators Gay G. Kernan and Michael Padilla, and Representatives Kelly K. Fajardo, Joanne J. Ferarry, Stephanie Garcia Richard, Rick Little, Patricia Roybal Caballero, Tomas E. Salazar, and Linda M. Trujillo.

The following voting and advisory members were not present: Voting: Vice Chair G. Andres Romero, Senator Candace Gould, and Representatives Christine Trujillo and Monica Youngblood; Advisory: Senators Carlos Cisneros, Daniel A. Ivey-Soto, Linda M. Lopez, Howie C. Morales, and John Pinto, and Representatives David M. Gallegos, Jimmie C. Hall, D. Wonda Johnson, Tim D. Lewis, Angelica Rubio, Patricio Ruiloba, Gregg Schmedes, Debra M. Sarinana, Elizabeth “Liz” Thomson, and Jim R. Trujillo.

LFC Program Evaluation: Higher Education Funding Formula. Micaela Fischer, Legislative Finance Committee (LFC) Program Evaluator, introduced the evaluation by reviewing the higher education funding formula. The formula uses prior year higher education appropriations to determine the base amount. LFC and Higher Education Department (HED) analysts decide how much will be distributed to institutions as a result of performance, with the remainder staying with the schools. Last year, the agreed-upon performance amount was 4 percent of the base, added to an additional 2 percent of new appropriations. The formula then reallocates the performance-based funding based on five metrics – total degrees and certificates awarded; science, technology, engineering, math, and health (STEM-H) awards; at-risk awards; completed credit hours; and mission-specific funding. Institutions that award more credentials generally receive more funding. For example, in FY19, the University of New Mexico (UNM) awarded 36.8 percent of all credentials, and UNM received 36.8 percent of the funding available for the total awards metrics.

Degree and certificate attainment has increased 23 percent, largely from certificates and associate’s degrees. Liberal arts and humanities certificates and associate’s degrees grew more than 600 percent over prior years. Yet, New Mexico students who transfer from two- to four-year institutions perform worse at completing their bachelor’s degrees on time than comparable students nationally, suggesting these students are not prepared or are unsupported for completing a bachelor’s degree within six years.

Ms. Fischer noted new metrics are needed to encourage colleges to meet broader higher education goals. LFC found higher education funding formulas function best with fewer, but more meaningful metrics that have more weight, such as rewarding job placement and increasing incentives for graduating at-risk students.

The two key recommendations from the evaluation are: reduce performance funding by 4.45 percent per year over the next two years, and allocate those funds to at-risk awards, with the remainder being used to transition to new metrics like job placement; and phase out the use of STEM-H and other mission-specific metrics between now and FY25, instead allocating those funds directly for job placement and student success.

Dr. Barbara Damron, Secretary of the Higher Education Department, noted HED is looking for ways to allocate funding that are fair to institutions while still holding them accountable. HED collaborated with LFC and agreed with most of the recommendations, including: improving access for at-risk students, reexamining the distribution of formula funds; eliminating current metrics in favor of new ones; improved correlation between performance measures and outcomes; ensuring credentials should be meaningful from a workforce development standpoint; incentivizing job placement of graduates; and expanding local mill levies for branch community colleges to \$2 million.

Dr. Damron noted there is still need for STEM-H workers in the state, and STEM-H should be expanded to include areas of workforce demand, such as the energy sector. She indicated 14 percent of outcomes funding should be directed to institutional efficiency benchmarks. Dr. Damron also highlighted the need to address the changing nature of students in higher education, noting the majority of students are adult learners, and institutions should consider changing their program structure to allow more night, weekend, and online courses to help those students access classes.

Senator Brandt asked whether the amount appropriated for the formula changes with student enrollment. Dr. Damron replied it is not tied directly to enrollment. Noting that Ms. Fischer indicated New Mexico postsecondary institutions get more state funding per student than institutions in other states, Senator Brandt asked about the national average per-student funding amount. Dr. Damron noted New Mexico allocates the second highest amount of funding per student to postsecondary institutions, at about \$7,000 per students annually.

Senator Soules asked how long the funding formula's current metrics had been in place, and how it should change. Dr. Damron said the formula was initiated in FY13 and has experienced some minor changes, but nothing since FY15. The senator then asked how the formula was impacted by the state's fiscal issues, to which Dr. Damron replied it affected staffing levels and resources more at some institutions than others, in some cases forcing schools to examine their efficiency.

Senator Soules asked how it was decided to incentivize STEM-H awards in the formula, concerned the state is incentivizing positions that may leave the state over greatly needed positions like teachers and social workers, who are more likely to stay. Dr. Damron noted the decision was made by a group of legislators, LFC staff, HED staff, and higher education institutions.

Representative Salazar asked about the level of student debt in New Mexico, with Dr. Damron replying that New Mexico has lower levels of student debt in the state due in part to legislative efforts to pay students' tuition and keep tuition costs low.

Representative Linda Trujillo asked about the evaluation, which noted a 32 percent completion rate for students transferring between two- and four-year institutions, and a 28 percent completion rate for students receiving Pell grants. Ms. Fischer replied the statistics refer to the percent of students who receive a Pell grant and graduate within six years. Representative Trujillo then asked how a system tracking students past graduation into the workforce would operate and how much it would cost. Dr. Damron said different states track students in different ways, but New Mexico has not had the resources to accomplish this. She noted HED is working on a cost estimate for a longitudinal system, which could be costly. Finally, the representative asked about HED acting as a research body for this function, leaving PED to act as a financing and oversight

body. The secretary replied that, currently, there is lack capacity to do that, but the capacity could be built.

Representative Royal Caballero asked about defining at-risk students by income level rather than Pell grant eligibility, and aligning financial need to available financial assistance. Dr. Damron noted estimates of at-risk students do not capture all students, and many students lack the ability to complete the necessary paperwork for financial aid. She recommended more funding for the already robust student aid programs in the state, and making the free application for federal student aid simpler and more user friendly. The representative then asked about inviting private industry to help leverage higher education costs. Dr. Damron replied that she has been in contact with several industries who might be interested in helping with that.

Career Technical Education in New Mexico. David Latham, Principal, Secondary Learning Center, Rio Rancho Public Schools (RRPS) noted career technical education (CTE) provides students with career experience and postsecondary options. He said high school graduation rates for CTE students are about 15 percent higher than the national average of approximately 83 percent. RRPS offers a dual approach for CTE, including on-campus courses, off-campus dual credit pathways, and internships. To maximize resources, RRPS partnered with Central Community College of New Mexico (CNM), designing their CTE programs as dual credit, dual enrollment pathways. Mr. Latham said RRPS's successful nursing program is in its second year, and the school district is working toward adding career pathways for network administration and automotive mechanics.

Benton Spradlin, Secondary Career Technical Instruction Coach, Rio Rancho Public Schools indicated RRPS's offers CTE programs at Rio Rancho and Cleveland high schools, including business and marketing, video and audio production, culinary arts, agriculture, engineering, and biomedical programs. Other programs can be added to accommodate demands of the job market. Currently, the Department of Workforce Solutions (DWS) indicates there is job demand in healthcare, business, and information technology, for which RRPS thinks a career path and CTE program should be created. He indicated expansion of RRPS's CTE programs would require funding for additional teachers, curriculum, and materials such as hardware and software.

Dr. Jesse Chenven, Education Faculty, CNM, spoke about CNM's recently added CTE teacher-training programs, noting licensure requirements are less stringent for CTE teachers. Those with a background in the field they will teach can be licensed and begin teaching after completing a professional development plan approved by the Public Education Department (PED) or 15 credit-hours of coursework, as required by regulations. He indicated New Mexico schools have difficulty finding CTE teachers, prompting CNM to initiate a CTE certificate program that provides the 15 credit-hours of training required by regulation. Dr. Chenven noted CNM has been working with RRPS and Educators Rising – a free national membership organization for aspiring teachers and their mentors – to help high school students become teachers, creating a dual credit option for those already taking education course work.

Chair Stewart asked if CNM offers licenses to people who lack a degree, to which Dr. Chenven replied regulations allows licenses for those with a high school diploma and five years' experience in their field. Individuals can be licensed as level one CTE teachers, with the opportunity to move to a level two license.

Kay Provolt, State Director, Jobs for America's Graduates – New Mexico (JAG) spoke of JAG's leadership development and dropout prevention programs for youth who encounter barriers to success. JAG International was established 38 years ago and has served 1 million students across 13 communities, while the local JAG chapter was established 14 years ago and has served over 3,200 students. Outcomes for the nationwide class of 2017 included a 98 percent graduation rate compared with New Mexico's rate of 71.1 percent, and a high employment rate. The program has

helped over 50 percent of its graduates continue to postsecondary education over the past five years at six New Mexico high schools. JAG students participate in career days, job-shadowing, mentoring, and tutoring through JAG's relationship with DWS. JAG assists students for up to one year after their graduation. Ms. Provolt noted JAG has been funded with federal Perkins funding that PED has chosen to discontinue.

Reyes Calabaza, a senior and president of JAG at Bernalillo High School, and Isaac Garcia, a senior at Rio Grande High School and past president of JAG, spoke about JAG's impact. They noted the program helped with interview preparation, building confidence and skills, and providing access to internships.

Representative Little stated more life skills should be taught in high school, rather than the many statutory academic graduation requirements, such as trigonometry or algebra II. He asked Ms. Calabaza and Mr. Garcia if additional work for the JAG program made high school more difficult, to which they responded JAG is primarily a support system to assist with graduation, rather than additional academic work. The representative then asked what percentage of students are in JAG or other CTE programs. Mr. Spradlin replied RRPS has at least 1,500 students in at least one CTE class, out of about 5,200 total students, and Mr. Latham said their dual credit program has between 50 and 55 students.

Senator Soules asked how hands-on programs such as CTE are taught online, specifically asking about methods courses and fieldwork. Dr. Chenven explained CNM use interactive video for online instruction, though Senator Soules stated this did not seem like an effective delivery methodology for practicum instruction. Senator Soules then asked who verifies licensure work experience requirements for CTE teachers. Dr. Chenven said CNM uses PED's guidelines for licensing, and PED verifies the requirements. Senator Soules asked if school districts hire CTE teachers based on the prior work experience. Dr. Chenven noted CTE licensure is unique in not requiring a degree, as work experience in a CTE field can be more important than teaching experience, but Senator Soules continued to express concern with prioritizing work experience for teachers over postsecondary degrees.

Senator Brandt asked what qualifies a student to participate in JAG. Ms. Provolt replied JAG students are recommended based on early coursework and environmental and social barriers to their success. Senator Brandt asked how schools decide which CTE programs to offer, and Mr. Latham replied they examine what each program needs, such as funding, teachers, equipment, and facilities, and whether those needs can be met. He noted it can be unrealistic to expect high-school students to commit to a program of study, emphasizing that career pathways should be flexible enough to allow students to change their minds. Finally, Senator Brandt suggested some tradespersons have higher earnings than those with advanced degrees, making it less likely people in lucrative, high-demand fields would teach fulltime.