

Fiscal impact reports (FIRs) are prepared by the Legislative Finance Committee (LFC) for standing finance committees of the Legislature. LFC does not assume responsibility for the accuracy of these reports if they are used for other purposes.

FISCAL IMPACT REPORT

SPONSOR <u>Herndon/Dixon</u>	LAST UPDATED _____
	ORIGINAL DATE <u>02/08/2023</u>
SHORT TITLE <u>Holocaust and Genocide Studies Act</u>	BILL NUMBER <u>House Bill 111</u>
	ANALYST <u>Chilton</u>

ESTIMATED ADDITIONAL OPERATING BUDGET IMPACT* (dollars in thousands)

	FY23	FY24	FY25	3 Year Total Cost	Recurring or Nonrecurring	Fund Affected
	\$100.0			\$100.0	Nonrecurring	General Fund
Total	\$7.0	\$7.0	\$7.0	\$21.0	Recurring	General Fund

Parentheses () indicate expenditure decreases.
*Amounts reflect most recent analysis of this legislation.

Partial conflict with House Bill 126.

Sources of Information

LFC Files

Responses Received From

Office of African American Affairs (OAAA)
Public Education Department (PED)

No Response Received

Indian Affairs Department (IAD)
Regional Education Cooperatives (REC)
Albuquerque Public Schools (APS)

SUMMARY

Synopsis of House Bill 111

House Bill 111, creating the Holocaust and Genocide Studies Act, would mandate the study of genocide in general and of the Holocaust in Europe during the 1930s and 1940s, defined as the “systematic, bureaucratic, state-sponsored persecution of approximately 6 million Jewish people and 5 million other persons by the Nazi regime and its collaborators.”

The bill would require the study of the Holocaust and genocide studies in seventh through 12th grade and the creation of an unpaid Holocaust and genocide studies council to advise public schools on provision of appropriate instruction on these subjects. Its nine members would be

appointed by the governor from among people with knowledge and interest in these subjects. It would meet at least three times per year, would promote Holocaust and genocide education in and out of schools, would advise PED on the content of instruction in these areas, and would collect data on bullying and on race- or ethnic-group-connected violence and human rights violations, reporting to the governor and Legislature.

Under the bill, PED would work with the council to

- A. Prepare students to discuss the Holocaust and genocides;
- B. Teach the breadth of the horrors of the Holocaust and its political underpinnings in Nazi Germany;
- C. Promote consideration of the term “genocide” and its applicability to international law;
- D. Increase students’ respect for cultural diversity;
- E. Promote personal responsibility, civic engagement, and societal responses to violations of human rights;
- F. Stimulate students to consider their roles in combatting misinformation;
- G. Give students opportunities to understand roles of individuals and groups that are perpetrators, collaborators, bystanders, victims, and rescuers;
- H. Help students understand the effects of prejudice, racism, and stereotyping;
- I. Preserve holocaust survivors’ memories and help students honor them and their cultures;
- J. Provide context for student understanding of discrimination and atrocities in this state;
- K. Discuss means by which humanity can move forward from genocide.

HB111 would require each school district and charter school to provide education on these subjects for school staff, with PED reporting to the council in compliance, and for each school district and charter school to offer seventh and eighth graders an elective on the Holocaust and genocide starting with 2024-2025 school year.

The effective date of this bill is July 1, 2023.

FISCAL IMPLICATIONS

There is no appropriation in House Bill 111. Per diem and mileage for council members, according to PED, would amount to about \$7,000 per year. In addition, in setting up the program, an estimated \$100 thousand would be required for curriculum development in its first year.

SIGNIFICANT ISSUES

Genocides carried out by groups in power against their enemies or perceived enemies or against those thought to be “inferior” have occurred across history. Content information about genocide and holocaust studies already exists in the New Mexico Social Studies Instruction Scope document on world history.¹ An excerpt relevant to the Holocaust of the 1930s and 1940s and the Armenian genocide of 2015-2018 is attached. While instruction scope documents contain the required standards to be taught in all public schools, how each standard is taught is a local decision, which could be slightly different from one district to another depending on resources

¹ <https://webnew.ped.state.nm.us/bureaus/curriculum-instruction/new-mexico-instructional-scope-nmis/nmis-social-studies/>

and personnel.

The Holocaust carried out under orders of the National Socialist party in Germany and parts of Europe conquered by Germany in the 1940s is only one of the most egregious examples of genocide, a term new to the English language in 1944. Other relatively recent genocidal events are listed in the following table, which is certainly not complete:

Location of Genocide	Year(s)	Group Subjected to Genocide
Darfur, Sudan	2003-2010	Fur, Zaghawa, Masalit ethnic groups
Rwanda	1994	Tutsi
Bosnia-Herzegovina	1992	Bosnian Muslims
Cambodia	1975-79	Cambodians
Germany, Poland, all of Nazi-Occupied Europe	1940s	Jews, Roma, homosexuals, Roma, "mental defectives"
Nanking, China	1937	Chinese civilians
Eastern Turkey	1915-1918	Armenians
Namibia	1904-1907	Hereros
United States	1600s-1800s	Native Americans
Africa; North, Central and South America	1619-1865	Africans subjected to slave trade

In a 2017 scholarly article, a group of researchers led by Gerene Starrett detailed the finding of a study on Holocaust education approaches:

This community-based research investigated the relationship among Holocaust knowledge, Holocaust education experiences, and citizenship values in adults residing in the US. This study contributes to the literature an inferential investigation that reports positive civic attitudes associated with Holocaust education. A moderate correlation was identified, with approximately 10% of the variance in citizenship scores explained by Holocaust knowledge. Multiple regression analyses revealed Holocaust knowledge as the strongest predictor of citizenship values, followed by gender, suburban/urban childhood community, and learning about the Holocaust in school, respectively. Of eight unique Holocaust education experiences examined, learning about the Holocaust in school was the strongest predictor of citizenship values, followed by hearing a Holocaust survivor testimony in person or via electronic media, and visiting a Holocaust museum, respectively. Findings can inform Holocaust education policy, research, and practice, including the potential role of Holocaust curriculum in the larger context of moral and civic education. Holocaust knowledge and Holocaust education experiences predict citizenship values among US adults.²

ADMINISTRATIVE IMPLICATIONS

According to PED:

The bill would require the creation of a council composed of nine members appointed by

² Starratt GK, Fredotovic I, Goodletty S, Starratt C. Holocaust knowledge and Holocaust education experiences predict citizenship values among US adults. *J. Moral Education* 46:177-194, 2017.

the governor, which would be required to meet at least three times each year to advise the PED, school districts, and charter schools about Holocaust and genocide studies. Between its formation on July 1, 2023, and the start of SY25, PED, in consultation with the Holocaust and Genocide Studies Council, would be tasked with developing academic content and performance standards for Holocaust and genocide studies, guidelines for which are outlined in HB111.

CONFLICT

A provision in HB111 concerning graduation requirements partially conflicts with HB126, which reduces the number of high school credits needed for graduation from 24 to 22.

TECHNICAL

There appears to be conflict between Section 3 of the bill, which requires that teaching about the Holocaust and genocide is to be part of seventh through 12th grades, while Sections 7 and 8 only require electives in this area be offered, beginning in the 2024-2025 school year. A certain minimum of time studying Holocaust and genocide studies might be specified.

LAC/al/hg

Excerpts from the **New Mexico Social Studies Instructional Scope** document on World History. The entire document is available at <https://webnew.ped.state.nm.us/bureaus/curriculum-instruction/new-mexico-instructional-scope-nmis/nmis-social-studies/> (see High School World History)

Students Who Demonstrate Understanding Can...

- Explain how understanding historical events can develop as more information or discoveries are made concerning historical events.
- Provide examples of how historical thinking has changed because of new discoveries

Vocabulary for Teacher Development

- Shoah - the Hebrew word for Holocaust.
- Holocaust - the State Sponsored Nazi attempt to wipe out Jewish, Roma, homosexual, people with disabilities, among others, for being sub-human and not fitting within Nazi ideology. Close to 6 million European Jews and another 3 million of various backgrounds were murdered between 1941 and 1945.
- Social Darwinism - the belief that some races are genetically superior to others due to evolution and deserve to exist while others do not.
- Nationalism - the belief that one's nation is superior to others

High School World History – New Mexico Instructional Scope, Page 33

Sample Concept/Content

- Armenian Genocide
- Holocaust/Shoah
- North Atlantic Slave Trade
- Rwandan Genocide
- Holodomor
- Black War
- Nuremberg Trials
- United States Indian War

Supporting Questions

- What takes place in a society that allows genocide to take place?
- What roles do race, ethnicity and ableism play in genocidal actions?
- What are the consequences of genocide?
- What actions are appropriate to take after genocide has taken place?

Page 50

Sample Task #4

1. Students will view the short film "Introducing the Armenian Genocide". Students will gather evidence as they watch with the following questions in mind, then discuss as a class: a. In what ways did WWI influence Ottoman leaders to target Armenian populations within their borders? b. What atrocities did Armenian communities face between 1915 and 1916?
2. Students will view at least 3 videos of Testimony from Survivors of the Armenian Genocide. Students can access videos from USC's Shoah Foundation's IWITNESS collection. Students will record details about survivors' stories to share with the class.

3. Students will view the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum's "Why We Remember" video. Students will gather evidence as they watch with the following questions in mind, then discuss as a class: a. In addition to the systematic policies of the Nazi German government, who were the "people who participated in different ways, who made it possible"? b. Why should we remember? c. What moral challenges do we still face today regarding genocide, and how should we respond?
4. Students will use the USC Shoah Foundation's visual history collection to view at least 3 videos of testimony from survivors of the Holocaust. Access Videos [HERE](#). Students will record details about survivors' experiences to share with the class.
5. Students will work collaboratively to do online research identifying locations where there are present day reports of genocide. Students will create a short news brief detailing the location, who is involved, why one group is targeting the other. The news brief should explain the similarities and differences they see between these reports, the Armenian Genocide, and the Holocaust.

News Brief: Present Day Reports of Genocide Sources report China is committing Genocide against Uyghurs and other religious and ethnic minorities in Xinjiang.

China has had a history of targeting ethnic minorities. In 2014, authorities then began fining those families with too many children. The goal was to only allow families to have 3 children at most. Women were then forced to have IUD insertions, abortions, etc.... The Chinese government has been targeting the Uyghurs on the basis of their ethnic and religious identity. This is when the detention camps were built. These people were taken to the camps if they were caught going to religious weddings, praying, or visiting a mosque. This is one of the largest mass interments since World War 2. Many have no idea what took place in these camps but know that many were not able to make it out. In the year of 2019 there was a report saying that the camps were shut down. But satellite images taken in the year of 2020 report that these camps still continue to take people in. Some experts argue that cultural genocide is a more accurate description of the events in Xinjiang. Pages 84-86